

PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE
19th June 2014

<u>UPRN</u>	<u>APPLICATION NO.</u>	<u>Item No:</u> <u>DATE VALID</u>
	14/P0525	13/02/2014
Address/Site	1 Marryat Place, Wimbledon, London, SW19 5BL	
Ward	Village	
Proposal:	Demolition of existing bungalow and erection of detached 6 bedroom dwelling house (including basement accommodation)	
Drawing Nos	PD – 104 rev A, 105 rev A, 106 rev A, 107 rev C, 108 rev D, 109 rev C, 131 rev C, 132 rev C, 133 rev C, 134 rev C, 135 rev C, 151 rev B and 152 rev B,	
Contact Officer:	Stuart Adams (0208 545 3147)	

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions.

CHECKLIST INFORMATION.

Heads of agreement: - N/A
Is a screening opinion required: No
Is an Environmental Statement required: No
Has an Environmental Impact Assessment been submitted – No
Press notice – Yes
Site notice – Yes
Design Review Panel consulted – No
Number of neighbours consulted – 8
External consultations – No.
PTAL score – 1b
CPZ – VO's

1. **INTRODUCTION**

- 1.1 The application has been brought before the Planning Applications Committee for consideration, given the number of objections received and case officer's recommendation to grant permission subject to conditions

2. **SITE AND SURROUNDINGS**

- 2.1.1 The existing house which is proposed to be demolished is a traditional single storey detached bungalow fronting onto Marryat Place, Wimbledon. The application site is the corner plot situated at the junction between the cul-de-sac of Marryat Place and Marryat Road. Due to the application site's corner position, the side elevation of the existing house faces the Marryat Road street frontage. The adjoining property to the north-east at 64 Marryat Road is a 2-storey house and to the other side on Marryat Place, it is 2 Marryat Place, which is a bungalow
- 2.1.2 The surrounding area is generally characterised by two storey detached and semi-detached houses, with an eclectic mix of dwelling types. Due to the topography of Marryat Place and Marryat Road, the three pairs of semi-detached houses currently being constructed at the bottom of the cul-de-sac sit down much lower than neighbouring houses.
- 2.2 The property is located adjacent to the Wimbledon North Conservation Area.

3. **CURRENT PROPOSAL**

- 3.1 The proposal is for the demolition of existing bungalow and erection of detached 6 bedroom dwelling house (including basement accommodation).
- 3.2 The proposed house would comprise a two storey building with accommodation within the roof space and basement level. The proposed house would have a traditional design approach with brickwork facades, timber sash windows, clay tiled roof, cast stone detailing, projecting bays and a two storey turret.
- 3.3 The scheme has been amended from its original form following comments received from neighbouring properties and concerns from the Council regarding the overall size and massing of the proposed building. Amendments were sought to reduce the bulk and massing of the building with the following changes being made:

- Revised footprint (including basement) to create a staggered footprint which also helps achieve changes in roof angles of the main roof to create a smaller element of flat roof.
- Ground levels have been lowered to create lower ridge and eaves levels. In comparison to the original scheme, the proposed eaves and ridge height of the main roof have been lowered by 0.65m and 0.75m respectively and the eaves and ridge height of the proposed turret have been lowered by 0.8m and 1.71m respectively.
- The roof dormers fronting Marryat Place have now been replaced with conservation area roof lights.
- Decreased size of bay fronting Marryat Road which has a reduced height (as above), width and alignment.
- The footprint of the building has moved 1.2m (max) further away from Marryat Place frontage (0.4m turret).

4. **PLANNING HISTORY**

- 4.1 MER737/66 - Erection of bungalow with integral garage and alteration of existing vehicular access – Grant -15/12/1966
- 4.2 MER494/45 - Two storey dwelling with integral garage – Grant - 07/10/1965
- 4.3 WIM7607 - Erection of three houses and three double garages on land of 62 Marryat and the construction of new access road off Marryat Road – Grant - 10/07/1964
- 4.4 WIM7367 - Three detached houses and one detached bungalow – Grant - 20/04/1964
- 4.5 WIM6429A - Outline application for one bungalow and three houses all with garages and a new access road off Marryat Road – Grant - 11/10/1962
- 4.6 WIM6054 - Outline-to erect five detached houses and one semi detached house with four garages and a pump house – Refused - 15/01/1962

5. **CONSULTATION**

- 5.1.1 The application has been advertised by conservation area site and press notice procedure and letters of notification to the occupiers of neighbouring properties.
- 5.1.2 In response to consultation (original scheme), 8 letters of objection were received. The letters of objection raise the following points:

- Massive scale of development
- Out of character with houses on Marryat Road
- Loss of privacy with windows able to look directly into rear gardens
- Increase in traffic
- Proposed boundaries outside the existing building line in Marryat Place
- Higher house than existing and sited close to number 62 Marryat Road (unacceptably close, out of proportion, loss of outlook and privacy).
- Windows facing neighbouring properties should be obscured glazed
- 62 Marryat Road is situated on higher ground (4m higher up the hill). The height of the proposed house should respond to house next to it on Marryat Road or Marryat Place rather than extrapolating number 62 Marryat Road.
- House too high
- Lack of conformity with neighbours
- Site has an existing open view of London over the rooftops as you descend along Marryat Road. Proposal would detract from this open feel for the adjoining properties.
- Proportion of floor space to outdoor space on the plot contravene guidelines
- Set precedent
- Loss of light
- Proposed basement would come extremely close to side boundary
- Existing retaining wall (unstable) should be rebuilt as part of development
- Not compatible with rhythm and scale of the houses in Marryat Road.
- Open and landscaped character needs to be protected
- Disrespects current street roofline profile
- Increase in density

5.1.3 Wimbledon Society

- The mass and height of the structure are regarded as excessive and it fails to respect its location adjoining two Conservation Areas.
- Dominant and unsympathetic impact on neighbouring properties and street scene.
- Merton policy DM H4(a+b) states that proposals should achieve sustainability code level 5, rather than code level 4 as proposed.
- Merton policy DMD2 (b+c) states that proposals should set out methods of construction to demonstrate protection of the stability of new and existing nearby buildings. Any resubmitted proposals for

development should demonstrate details of how this is to be achieved.

- Overlooking from side windows
- Excessive height of single storey rear element (due to changes in ground levels) would create loss of light and sunlight.
- Any future application should aim to increase the amount of green garden space around the property and condition to remove permitted development rights.

5.1.4 Parkside Residents Association

- Prominent frontage on both Marryat Road and Marryat Place
- Dominant feature of the design is a 2.5 story hexagonal tower with a steeply pitched turret roof.
- This is a key location as the site is prominently in view (looking North out of the Conservation Area) from the junction of Marryat Road and Burghley Road (a view accentuated by the downward slope of Marryat Road towards the All England Club to the North).
- Although the existing bungalow on the site does not have particular architectural merit, its siting, height and proportions do at least respect the surrounding development pattern and setting and the important visual amenity in this location.
- Unsympathetic siting and design affecting the setting of locally listed building.
- Negative impact upon conservation area
- Tower and turret feature strikes an incongruous note. Whilst there are one or two houses elsewhere in Marryat Road which incorporate a similar feature, these are all more substantial buildings and standing in large plots with wider street frontages. On this plot, which is relatively small, the tower/turret feature detracts considerably from the overall design. Far from adding character, it looks to be a cramped, unsympathetic addition, which also gives the impression of an unfortunate asymmetry with the proportion of the bay and gable on the Marryat Road elevation contrasts with the simple steeped pitch of the roof in the adjoining Marryat Road houses to the north and the pitched roofs of the distinctive gables of 62 Marryat Road to the South.
- Design is undistinguished, unsympathetic and is out of character with the surrounding properties in the Conservation Area.
- Out of character
- The proposed new house offers no symmetry with no 64 and conflicts strongly with the pattern of design of no 64 and the remainder of the group. Significantly higher roofline only serves to highlight the conflict and detract significantly from the attractive visual impact of the neighbouring houses.
- Overlooking

- Request for following conditions if approved – working hours, non-obstruction of Marryat Place and Marryat Road, method statement (development carried out in accordance with), removal of permitted development rights and no use of flat roof.

5.1.5 Following amendments to the scheme and further consultation with neighbours, four letters of objections were received (including one from the Parkside Residents Association). The letters of objection raise the following points:

- Loss of privacy and overlooking
- Loss of daylight and sunlight
- Design does not conform with the height, scale and architectural character of most of the houses in the area of Marryat Road and would thereby diminish their setting
- Basement would come extremely close to side boundary and would need to be closely monitored
- Increased traffic
- Vital open and landscaped character should be protected
- Existing boundary wall is unstable and should be rebuilt to an agreed height and standard
- Domination of adjoining neighbour
- Objections still stand despite amendments
- Proposed boundary is outside the existing building line in Marryat Place
- The building is still much too large and high for the plot it sits on
- Impact upon watercourse that run down from the top of the hill
- Out of scale

Parkside Residents Association

- Prominent frontages on both Marryat Road and Marryat Place
- Although the existing bungalow on the site does not have particular architectural merit, its siting, height and proportions do at least respect the surrounding development pattern and setting and the important visual amenity in this location.
- Unsympathetic siting and design affecting the setting of locally listed building
- Negative impact upon conservation Area
- Dominant and negative impact upon the street scene and views from the Conservation Area.
- Tower and turret feature on the south western corner strikes an incongruous note, far from adding character; it looks to be a crammed unsympathetic addition which also gives the impression of an unfortunate asymmetry with the proportions of the bay and

gable on the Marryat Road elevation.

- Overall design is undistinguished, unsympathetic and out of character with the surrounding properties in the conservation area.
- Does not preserve or enhance the setting of the conservation area
- No material change to the Marryat Road frontage
- Offers no symmetry with no 64 and conflicts strongly with the pattern of design of no 64 and the remainder of the group
- Dominant impact upon neighbouring amenity due to changes in ground levels
- Overlooking.

6. **POLICY CONTEXT**

6.1 The relevant policies within the Adopted Unitary Development Plan (October 2003) are:

BE.3 (Development adjacent to a Conservation Area)

HS.1 (Housing Layout and Amenity).

BE.14 (Archaeological Evaluation)

BE.15 (New Buildings and Extensions, Daylight, Sunlight, Privacy, Visual Intrusion and Noise)

BE.16 (Urban Design)

BE.22 (Design of New Development)

6.2 The following Supplementary Planning Guidance notes are also relevant:

New Residential Development (December 1999)

Planning Obligations (July 2006)

6.3 The relevant policies within the Adopted Core Strategy (July 2011) are:

CS8 – Housing Choice

CS9 - Housing Provision

CS14 - Design

CS18 – Active Transport

CS19 – Public Transport

CS20 - Parking, Servicing and Delivery

6.4 The Relevant policies in the London Plan (July 2011) are:

3.3 (Increasing Housing Supply),

3.4 (Optimising Housing Potential),

3.5 (Quality and Design of Housing Developments),

3.8 (Housing Choice),

5.1 (Climate Change Mitigation),

5.3 (Sustainable Design and Construction).

- 6.5 Emerging policies within the Draft Sites and Policies Plan Feb 2014.
Paragraph 216 of the National Planning Policy Framework advises that a decision maker may give weight to relevant policies in emerging plans according to the stage of preparation of the emerging plan and the extent to which there are unresolved objections to relevant policies.
The London Borough of Merton draft 'Sites and Policies Plan' was considered by the independent Planning Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State at a public hearing in January 2014 and the final report was published on 4 June 2014. No changes are required to the February 2014 version 'Sites and Policies Plan (including all modifications) and the Plan is due to be formally adopted in July.
- 6.6 Relevant policies are DM D2 (Design Considerations in all developments), and DM D4 (Managing heritage assets). Given that Policy DM H4 'demolition and redevelopment of a single dwelling house' is a completely new policy, requiring CSH Level 5 for CO2 emissions and fabric efficiency which would fundamentally affect the design of a new house, it has been agreed by the Planning Policy and Development Control Managers that it will apply to new applications submitted after formal adoption of the Sites and Policies Plan in July.

7. PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

- 7.1 The principal planning considerations related to this application are the principle of demolition, the design of the new house and its impact upon the Marryat Place and Marryat Road street scene, adjacent Wimbledon North Conservation Area, standard of accommodation provided, impact upon neighbouring amenity and parking/highways considerations.
- 7.2 Amendments
- 7.2.1 Amendments were sought in order to reduce the bulk and massing of the building. This involved a revised footprint (including basement), building lowered into ground with lower ridge and eaves levels, change in angle of roof pitches, replacement of roof dormers fronting Marryat Place with conservation area roof lights, decreased size of bay fronting Marryat Road and building moved further away from Marryat Place frontage.
- 7.3 Principle of Development
- 7.3.1 The application site is located outside the Wimbledon North Conservation Area and therefore the principle of demolition does not need to be assessed against retained Policy BE2 of the UDP. The existing bungalow has little architectural merit although its siting maintains the openness at

the junction between Marryat Road and Marryat Place which has a positive influence on the adjacent Wimbledon North Conservation Area. There is no objection in principle to the redevelopment of the site for a replacement house provided that it respects the amenities of its neighbours and fits comfortably within the streetscene, preserving the setting and not detracting from views into and out of the adjacent Wimbledon North Conservation Area in accordance with retained UDP policies BE22 and BE.3.

7.4 Design

- 7.4.1 The proposed house would comprise a two storey building with accommodation within the roof space and basement level. The proposed house would have a traditional design approach with brickwork facades, timber sash windows, clay tiled roof, cast stone detailing, projecting bays and a two storey turret. The proposed traditional design and form of the building are considered to satisfactorily relate to the context of the site and the character and appearance of the Marryat Place and Marryat Road street scene.
- 7.4.2 In terms of the height of the proposed house, the amended scheme is now considered to satisfactorily respond with the decreasing roof heights along the Marryat Road street frontage due to the topography of the street. There is a gradual transition between the adjoining neighbouring properties on Marryat Road and the proposal, with eaves and ridge levels increasing up the hill to the entrance of the cul-de-sac.
- 7.4.3 In terms of the building height on the Marryat Place street frontage, it is inevitable that a new house on this site would not respond to the adjacent bungalow. However, the two storey height of surrounding properties should be noted, including the house on the other side of the entrance to the cul-de-sac (62 Marryat Road) and the recently approved houses (3 to 5 Marryat Place) at the end of the cul-de-sac currently under construction. Overall it is considered that the proposed house responds to the general pattern of development in the area and the change from a bungalow to a two storey building as well as general height and massing is considered to be acceptable.
- 7.4.4 In terms of siting and footprint, the existing bungalow's footprint leaves a narrow strip of amenity space to the rear which would provide insufficient amenity space and setting for the proposed new house. The amended footprint of the proposed building would create a more traditional building form and rear amenity space area as well as maintaining a suitable amount of openness at the junction of the cul-de-sac.

Conservation Area

7.4.5 The application site is located adjacent to the Wimbledon North Conservation Area which is located directly to the south and west of the application site. Planning Policy BE.3 (Development adjacent to a Conservation Area) requires that a development proposal adjacent to a Conservation Area will be expected to preserve or enhance its setting and not detract from views into and out of the area. It is considered that the proposal would preserve the setting of the adjoining Wimbledon North Conservation Area and would not detract from views into or out of the area.

7.5 Standard of Accommodation.

7.5.1 The proposed house would provide a satisfactory standard of accommodation for future occupiers in accordance with Policy HS.1 of the Council's adopted UDP. The proposed houses would exceed the London Plan Gross Internal Area minimum standards.

7.5.2 Each room would be capable of accommodating furniture and fittings in a satisfactory manner. Each habitable room has good outlook, levels of light, storage spaces and circulation areas. The house would have direct access to over 50m² of private amenity space at the rear of the building and exceeds the Council's minimum requirement.

7.6 Neighbouring Amenity

64 Marryat Road

7.6.1 The proposed frontage of the new house would align with the frontage of the existing neighbouring property at 64, therefore there would be no loss of light or outlook to its front rooms.

7.6.2 At the rear of the site, the footprint of the proposed house has been amended with the originally proposed single storey rear projection beyond this neighbour replaced with a sunken garden (so limiting neighbour impact). The two storey element, whilst projecting further to the rear (4.2m beyond this neighbour), would be inset a minimum of 4.4m from the boundary. Due to the siting of the proposed two storey element of the proposed house and its level of separation from the boundary, there is considered to be no undue loss of outlook.

2 Marryat Place

7.6.3 The proposed house would have a separation distance of 9.2m between the proposed rear elevation of the house and the flank wall of this neighbouring property. This neighbour is a single storey bungalow with no

windows on its flank serving habitable rooms. Whilst the proposed house would project between 1.8m and 3.1m beyond the frontage of this neighbour, this is not considered to have an unacceptably detrimental impact due to the separation distance between the two buildings.

7.7 Basement

7.7.1 The proposed basement would have a limited impact upon the visual amenities of the area with front and side light wells having a flush covering and the larger open light well at the rear would not be clearly visible from the public realm. There are no trees with high public amenity value that would be affected by the deeper excavation of the land.

7.7.2 Construction methodology

The appellant has commissioned an independent structural engineer (Sinclair Knight Merz) to produce a Subterranean Construction Method Statement in light of the proposed basement. The report indicates the following design approach to the build process:

7.7.3 *Ground conditions*

A single borehole was undertaken through the car parking area off Marryat Road. The results show 0.5 metre of made ground over 3.0 metres of superficial clays, which in turn, overlays London clay. The borehole was terminated at 12.0 metres depth. No ground water was encountered during drilling, but subsequent monitoring found water levels at between 2.56 and 2.89 metres depth. The lower levels of the excavation are likely to be below the water table...

7.7.4 *Install secant pile wall*

Ensure the ground conditions are suitable for the piling rigs that are to be used.

A continuous secant pile wall will need to be constructed around the perimeter of the proposed basement to prevent ground water ingress into the excavations. Due to the close proximity of adjacent structures these piles should be installed without the use of any vibrating equipment.

A series or grid of internal piles will also need to be installed

7.7.5 *Construct capping beam and install temporary braces*

Construct a concrete capping beam on top of the piled wall.

Install the temporary horizontal bracing beams or props.

7.7.6 *Excavate basement*

Basement excavation can now commence. This should be carried out evenly over the entire basement taking especial care around the internal piles to avoid damaging them.

The concrete lining to the perimeter walls may be constructed top down in stages to suit the excavation works.

Dewatering of the lower part of the excavations may be required.

7.7.7 *Construct basement floor slab*

Trim internal piles to final levels.

Unless the floor slab is designed to resist the pressures arising from clay heave it is imperative that an adequate layer of compressible material (e.g. Dufaylite Clayboard, Jablite Claymaster, etc.) is introduced under the concrete.

Construct concrete floor slab and complete concrete lining to the perimeter walls.

7.7.8 *Construct suspended ground floor slab*

Construct internal load bearing walls and construct the suspended concrete ground floor slab.

Remove any temporary horizontal bracing to the capping beam once the slab has cured and any propping and formwork used to construct the slab.

7.7.9 *Construct superstructure*

Construction may now continue with the superstructure elements of the building.

7.8 Parking and Traffic

7.8.1 The proposal would create space for 2 vehicles to park on site. This would provide a suitable level of parking provision for a property of this size.

7.9 Local Financial Considerations

The proposed development is liable to pay the Merton and Mayoral Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL), the funds for which will be applied by the Mayor towards the Crossrail project. Merton's Community Infrastructure Levy was implemented on 1st April 2014. This will enable the Council to raise, and pool, contributions from developers to help pay for things such as transport, decentralised energy, healthcare, schools, leisure and public open spaces - local infrastructure that is necessary to support new development. Merton's CIL has replaced Section 106 agreements as the principal means by which pooled developer contributions towards providing the necessary infrastructure should be collected.

8. **SUSTAINABILITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT REQUIREMENTS**

8.1.1 The proposal is for minor residential development and an Environmental Impact Assessment is not required in this instance.

8.1.2 The application does not constitute Schedule 1 or Schedule 2 development. Accordingly, there are no requirements in terms on EIA submission. The house will be required to meet Code Level 4 of the Code for Sustainable Homes and Lifetime Homes standards

9. **CONCLUSION**

9.1.1 The proposed development will provide a new family dwelling which is considered to satisfactorily relate to the context of the site and maintains an acceptable relationship with neighbouring properties. The standard of residential accommodation proposed is considered to meet the needs of future occupiers, with an appropriate level of amenity space and room sizes with good levels of outlook and light. There would be no undue impact upon neighbouring amenity, trees, traffic or highway conditions. The proposal is in accordance with Adopted Unitary Development Plan, Core Planning Strategy and London Plan policies. The proposal is therefore recommended for approval subject to conditions.

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION subject to the following conditions:

1. A1 Commencement of Development (full application)
2. A7 Approved Plans
3. B1 External materials to be approved

- 4. B4 Details of surface treatment
- 5. B5 Details of walls/Fences
- 6. C1 No permitted development (extensions)
- 7. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification), no window, dormer, rooflight or door other in the uppers levels of the rear or flank elevations than those expressly authorised by this permission shall be constructed without planning permission first obtained from the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To safeguard the amenities of the occupiers of nearby properties and to comply with policies BE.15 and BE.23 of the Adopted Merton Unitary Development Plan 2003.
- 8. C6 Refuse and Recycling (Details to be submitted)
- 9. C7 Refuse and Recycling (Implementation)
- 10. D11 Construction Times
- 11. F1 Landscaping/Planting Scheme
- 12. F2 Landscaping (Implementation)
- 13. Construction method statement
- 14. J1 Lifetimes Homes
- 15. L2 Code for sustainable homes – Pre commencement (New build residential)
- 16. L3 Code for sustainable homes – Pre Occupation (New build residential)
- 17. H9 Construction Vehicles
- 18. K1P Archaeology